

Action Plan and Progress Assessment (APPA) for the implementation of audit recommendations from the OAG- Prepared for the Select Standing Committee of Public Accounts
Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

An Independent Review of Commercial Vehicle Safety, Released December 2018

<http://www.bcauditor.com/pubs>

1st APPA Update [26/02/20]

Prepared by: Steve Haywood, Executive Director, Commercial Vehicle Safety & Enforcement and Passenger Transportation Branch, Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure

Reviewed by: Renee Mounteney, Assistant Deputy Minister, Highway Services, Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
1 Yes	We recommend that the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia continue its recent work to evaluate licensing strategies, including the effectiveness of B.C.'s commercial driver licensing standards, to improve road safety, and that it act upon the findings, in coordination with the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General. This should include consideration of mandatory entry-level training.	<p>The Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC), is working with the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General (PSSG) and the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure (TRAN) are developing a model for mandatory entry level training for Class 1 commercial drivers in BC.</p> <p>Additionally, ICBC, PSSG and TRAN has agreed to work with the federal government and other provinces and territories to develop a federal minimum standard for entry level training for Class 1 drivers.</p> <p>Revised: Target Date for decisions on implementation and timing of the BC training: 2019.</p> <p>Revised: Target Date for the federal standard: January 2020.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Partially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: ICBC has reviewed licensing and training best practices as they relate to reducing crashes.</p> <p>Industry consultation occurred July through to October 2019, to receive input on what an entry-level training program for Class 1 drivers could look like for BC. Consultation included forming an Advisory Group, Curriculum Group and eight Industry Workshops across BC.</p> <p>Legislative changes to the <i>Motor Vehicle Act</i> and regulatory changes to support mandatory training are underway.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: A decision on timing for implementation is expected Spring 2020.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: A federal entry level standard was accepted by the Council of Minister's responsible for Transportation and Highway Safety, February 14, 2020, and will be incorporated into the National Safety Code.</p>

² Target date is the date that audited organization expects to have "fully or substantially implemented" the recommendation. If several actions are planned to implement one recommendation, indicate target dates for each if they are different.

³The Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) will request that the audited organization provide a yearly update (i.e completed "Assessment of Progress and Actions Taken" column) until all recommendations are fully implemented or otherwise addressed to the satisfaction of the PAC. This is for the APPA update.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
2 Yes	We recommend that government establish clear responsibility for the promotion of commercial vehicle road safety education and awareness.	<p>A permanent oversight committee established by TRAN, PSSG and ICBC is reviewing commercial vehicle road safety education and awareness programs and will make enhancements to existing programs and establish a lead agency.</p> <p>Target Date for recommendation from the committee: Winter 2019.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Fully or substantially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN, PSSG and ICBC have established a permanent oversight committee for commercial vehicle road safety education and awareness.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monthly meetings/conference calls between the three agencies to share information and provide updates on road safety education and awareness initiatives. • A Standing Oversight Committee Working Group was established to review MOTI CVSE and other jurisdictions education and awareness programs and their evaluation processes to develop Best Practices for BC.
3 Yes	We recommend that the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia and the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General ensure program evaluation is a key component of the design and implementation of future education and awareness campaigns related to commercial vehicles	<p>ICBC and PSSG will work with TRAN through the committee established in Recommendation #2 to research best practices and review existing evaluation programs and develop a framework that will be used in future campaigns.</p> <p>Target date for best practice review: Summer 2019.</p> <p>Target date for framework completion: Fall 2019.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Fully or substantially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: A working group was established Summer 2019, comprised of staff from ICBC, PSSG and TRAN to review MOTI CVSE and other jurisdictions education and awareness programs and their evaluation processes to develop Best Practices for BC.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: Best Practices for Road Safety Education and Awareness Campaigns have been established, December 2019.</p> <p>The Best Practices inform road safety education and awareness campaign practitioners of best practices when developing and evaluating campaigns. The guide is composed of three sections:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setting the Stage for Success • Tools and Tactics for Campaign Implementation • Campaign Evaluation

³The Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) will request that the audited organization provide a yearly update (i.e completed “Assessment of Progress and Actions Taken” column) until all recommendations are fully implemented or otherwise addressed to the satisfaction of the PAC. This is for the APPA update.

⁴ This action plan and the subsequent updates have not been audited by the OAG. However, at a future date that Office may undertake work to determine whether the entity has implemented the recommendations. The results of that work will be reported in a separate report prepared by the OAG.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General’s Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
4 Yes	<p>We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure consider reviewing and modernizing the regulations and administrative policy to ensure Commercial Vehicle Safety and Enforcement staff can efficiently and effectively:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • assess whether designated inspection facilities have done inspections in compliance with program expectations and remove licences from non-compliant facilities where appropriate • address key safety risks not addressed under current policy • ensure only carriers that have demonstrated the knowledge and ability to operate safely are granted a National Safety Code certificate 	<p>TRAN is moving forward on improvement areas identified in a review of sections within the Motor Vehicle Act (MVA) specific to the Designated Inspection Facilities (DIF) by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • assessing a new DIF compliance program using a “bait” type vehicle; • assessing the administrative process for removal of non-complaint facilities; • assessing current policies in relation to safety risks, and; • working with ICBC and Advanced Education to explore options for expanding and enhancing the National Safety Code (NSC) knowledge testing program. <p>Target date for DIF compliance assessment: Fall 2019.</p> <p>Target date for policy safety risk assessment: Fall 2019.</p> <p>Target date for NSC testing enhancements/expansion: Spring 2020.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Partially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN has completed a review of sections with the MVA specific to the Vehicle Inspection Program (VIP), and the regulatory oversight of Designated Inspection Facilities (DIF) and Authorized Inspectors (AI).</p> <p>DIF Revised Target Date: Following deeper analysis of the regulation changes required for Division 25, a revised implementation date of Summer and Winter 2020 is now expected for implementation.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summer 2020 revisions will reflect current practice for the Vehicle Inspection Program. • Winter 2020 revisions will provide time for stakeholder consultation. <p>Policy Safety Risk Assessment: The assessment of policy safety risks (mechanical regulations) was completed, Fall 2019.</p> <p>NSC Testing: TRAN explored options for expanding accessibility to the NSC knowledge test. TRAN has identified an opportunity to work with Open School to develop an online test, that would have no cost to the applicants.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: Implementation - Summer 2020.</p> <p>A Quality Assurance Vehicle Pilot (bait type vehicle) to assess DIF compliance is expected to be underway Summer 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A working group was established in Summer 2019, to further identify regulation changes needed to reflect policy safety risks (mechanical regulations) to Division 4, 5, 6, 7, 10 & 11. • A DIF performance matrix is being developed to identify poor performance, expected completion, Summer 2020. • A review of Vehicle Inspection Program exemptions, specific to safety components, is underway. Expected completion, Summer 2020.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General’s Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
5 Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure review the structure of Commercial Vehicle Safety and Enforcement to ensure greater consistency in inspection and enforcement practices.	<p>TRAN is reviewing options to improve consistency in inspection and enforcement practices.</p> <p>Items being reviewed include training, policies and supervision practices across the province.</p> <p>Based on the information collected, TRAN will create a strategy to improve consistency in inspection and enforcement activities, which will then be implemented.</p> <p>Target date for completion of strategy: Spring 2020</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Partially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN has reviewed reporting structures across the province.</p> <p>A working group was established in Summer 2019 to explore training, policies and supervision practices. Actions are being implemented to support improved consistency in inspection and enforcement activities. These include updating templates and policies used by officers in conjunction with consistent hiring and training activities and revising operational CVSE Best Practices.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: Summer 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Considering changes to reflect current technological advances and innovation and how these could be implemented. • An additional working group to focus specifically on enhancements to CVSE hiring and training. • An assessment of the CVSE organizational structure will get underway Summer 2020 using the work created by the Consistency working group.
6 Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure ensure timely and consistent interventions with carriers.	In addition to the changes completed as described in the Actions Taken section, TRAN is exploring alternative program delivery options, including using third party auditing within a focused intervention deployment is required.	<p>Progress Assessment: Partially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN established a working group to explore alternative delivery options to support timely and consistent interventions with carriers, including third party auditing. Expected action plan, Spring 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TRAN will be publishing cancelled carrier profiles to a public facing website, Spring 2020. • TRAN is seeking additional resources to improve intervention times by focussing additional staff on carrier interventions.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
7 Yes	<p>We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure assess whether commercial vehicle safety and enforcement officers have the equipment, infrastructure, information and training they need to do their jobs safely and effectively, to ensure they can operate at the level necessary to deter non-compliance and meet ministry safety goals.</p>	<p>TRAN is updating an assessment of operations and officer safety to determine what changes to equipment, infrastructure, information and training are required, which will include a jurisdictional review.</p> <p>TRAN will continue to update strategic reviews of infrastructure, corridor usage, placement and operational deployment, examine officer safety and initiating a third-party assessment of the risks and challenges our officer face while conducting their duties.</p> <p>A comprehensive information technology project started in November 2018, to review and refresh the legacy CVSE IT systems, many of which are at end of life and due for replacement.</p> <p>The IT work will include the National Safety Code program, Vehicle Inspection Program, Commercial Vehicle Safety Alliance Inspection Program used by officers, and the Commercial Transport Management System interface that officers use on the front line.</p> <p>Target date for implementation plan: Winter 2019.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Partially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN has inventoried equipment, infrastructure, information and training across the province to provide information for the assessment described in the Actions Planned section.</p> <p>TRAN has completed a jurisdictional scan of CVSE officer training, Summer 2019.</p> <p>An Officer Safety working group has been established and have conducted a Safety Assessment, Winter 2019. A strategy is being developed and will be implemented Spring 2020. In addition, the PSA will conduct a supplemental assessment pre and post implementation of the recommendations.</p> <p>The comprehensive information technology replacing legacy VIP and NSC systems is underway. Expected completion, Winter 2022.</p> <p>Revised target date for implementation is Summer 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TRAN has struck working groups focused on these areas to assess and identify gaps for enhancements: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Systems group to identify enhancements to systems to support officer safety. ○ Hiring & Training to explore options to enhance existing training, including development of appropriate course content. ○ Infrastructure & Technology to explore existing and additional technology to support CVSE compliance, education and enforcement practices.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
8 Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure, the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia, and the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General ensure the sufficiency, reliability and accuracy of commercial vehicle safety data, and consider ways to integrate data sources to allow comprehensive analysis.	<p>TRAN, ICBC and PSSG will establish a cross sector working group to develop a coordinated strategy and implementation plan for identifying current challenges and establish mechanism to improve the sufficiency, reliability and accuracy of road safety data including commercial vehicle safety data.</p> <p>Invitations to participate in the working group will be extended to other government road safety partners.</p> <p>The working group will explore leveraging the expertise of the Integrated Data Division and the feasibility of a sector specific data warehouse to facilitate more comprehensive analysis.</p> <p>Target date to establish working groups: Spring 2019</p> <p>Target date to complete implementation plan: Spring 2020</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Fully or substantially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN, ICBC and PSSG established a working group to identify ways to improve data quality and reconciliation, and to identify opportunities for improved data sharing and integration of data sources, Spring 2019.</p> <p>Sector working groups establishing policies to streamline data sharing and identifying datasets to pilot, December 2019.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: Implementation Plan under development, expected Spring 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A CVSE Data Management working group was established to identify existing data sets and identify enhancements to improve data quality. • A CVSE Systems working group was established to existing data sets and systems that could be added in phases to the Passenger Transportation Management System.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com

Attention: Shirley Bond, Chair and Mitzi Dean, Deputy Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ¹	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ²	Assessment of Progress to date ³ and Actions Taken ⁴ (APPA update)
9 Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure collect and analyze data that enables it to develop appropriate targets and to evaluate the effectiveness of its commercial vehicle safety programs.	<p>TRAN will be working with external experts in exploring deeper analysis to determine which data is appropriate to develop measurable targets and the method to collect the data.</p> <p>The work will create measurable goals that will directly correlate to the effectiveness of commercial vehicles safety programs.</p> <p>Target date for completion of measurable goals and targets: Winter 2019.</p>	<p>Progress Assessment: Substantially implemented.</p> <p>Actions Taken & Discussion: TRAN has reviewed commercial vehicle data and performance measures in other jurisdictions, completed Fall 2019.</p> <p>Revised Target Date: TRAN is currently developing performance measures goals and targets using existing data sets, expected completion Spring 2020.</p> <p>Additional Proactive Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Performance Measures working group was established to explore data and possible targets, through their research they engaged Dr. Garland Chow to understand the formula used in the OAG report and how it could be applied to CVSE data in future. • Commercial vehicle audits in other jurisdictions also included recommendations for performance measures. TRAN will be connecting with those jurisdictions to identify data and targets that could be applied across multiple organizations.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Cc email to: the Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia actionplans@bcauditor.com