Ministry of Education

An Audit of the Education of Aboriginal Students in the B.C. Public School System, Released 11/15

http://www.bcauditor.com/pubs

Initial PAC Meeting- 03/02/16

1st Action Plan Update [DD/MM/YY]

2nd Action Plan Update [DD/MM/YY]

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
1.	Recommendation 1 We recommend that the Ministry of Education collaborate with boards of education, superintendents and Aboriginal leaders and communities, to develop a system-wide strategy with accountabilities for closing the gaps between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal student outcomes.	The Ministry agrees that collaboration is the key to effect system-wide change toward improving Aboriginal student success. Accordingly, the Ministry provides an environment of flexibility for boards, superintendents, Aboriginal leaders and communities to create strategies in response to their local situations.	February- August, 2016 to develop system wide strategy.	Partially Implemented	Designated lead on developing the strategy has been identified and contract is being developed. Framework for Enhancing Student Learning is under development with education partners.

¹ This should include all the recommendations listed in the Office of the Auditor General (OAG) report unless previously assessed as fully or substantially implemented. (i.e. only outstanding recommendations need to be reported).

Please provide your email response to:

Attention: Bruce Ralston, Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts

Email: Kate.Ryan-Lloyd@leg.bc.ca, Deputy Clerk and Clerk of Committees

Cc email to: the Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

²The Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) will request an update (i.e Assessment of Progress and Actions Taken column completed) on a yearly basis from the audited organization until all recommendations are fully implemented or otherwise addressed to the satisfaction of the PAC. After the first action plan update only outstanding recommendations (i.e. those not fully or substantially implemented) need to be reported.

³ This action plan and their subsequent updates have not been audited by the OAG. However, at a future date that Office may undertake work to determine whether the entity has fairly and accurately represented their progress in addressing the recommendations. The results of that work will be reported in a separate report prepared by the OAG.

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		What this looks like, currently, is the			
		Ministry working with boards and local			
		Aboriginal communities to improve			
		Aboriginal student performance			
		through Aboriginal education			
		enhancement agreements and			
		complementary accountability			
		reporting. With 56 of 60 districts			
		having completed at least one			
		agreement, this is a system-wide			
		strategy but one implemented at the			
		local level to better engage BC's many			
		distinct school districts, 203 First			
		Nations communities, Metis			
		associations, many other Aboriginal			
		organizations, and a wide variety of			
		education partners.			
		As recommended, the Ministry will also			
		work with all Education partners to			
		create a higher-level system-wide			
		strategy for Aboriginal education, and it			
		will include appropriate indicators of			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		success as part of the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning. These results will be reported on annually			
2.	Recommendation 2 We recommend that the Ministry of Education provide support to boards of education and superintendents to ensure they have the capacity to achieve results.	Ministry agrees that providing supports at the local level to superintendents and boards of education will ensure strategies have the best chance for success. Accordingly, the Ministry currently seconds two Aboriginal education enhancement agreement coordinators to assist in the local development and implementation of those agreements. Furthermore, the Ministry provides targeted funding to school districts for the provision of enhanced services to self-identified Aboriginal students.	Ongoing	Fully implemented- Development and implementation of Enhancement Agreements Not implemented- Superintendent of Aboriginal Learning to work directly with School Districts who are not achieving expected results	
		To further support a community of practice, the Ministry will also redouble its efforts to provide advice to boards of education and superintendents on effective practices, problem solving, and resourcing being employed in other regions of the province. This will be			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		communicated through provincial gatherings, publicly posting results, and providing feedback on annual reports submitted by boards. As well, the Ministry will directly engage with School Districts that are not achieving the desired outcomes to collaboratively implement actions to increase success levels.			
3.	Recommendation 3 We recommend that the Ministry of Education take action when districts have not achieved expected results for Aboriginal students.	The Ministry agrees that it has an obligation to act when districts require assistance to improve the school experience and success of Aboriginal students. Indeed, the Ministry believes that school districts are in the best position to respond to student needs and so it looks for ways to provide districts with the best tools possible to improve results.	September, 2016	Partially Implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	The Ministry of Education is working with school districts and education partners to develop and implement the Framework for Enhancing Student learning, with a clear focus on each student, as well as Aboriginal students, and students with special needs.
		Accordingly, the Ministry currently works collaboratively with school districts to analyze results and provides opportunities for districts to share and	Ongoing	Not implemented- Superintendent of Aboriginal Achievement	List of potential candidates have been discussed and exploratory conversations with candidates have been undertaken.
		discuss successful strategies. These opportunities include provincial		Partially implemented-	Provincial gathering held October 22. Next

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		gatherings during the year and learning shared by the Aboriginal education enhancement agreement coordinators as they travel the province.		regular provincial gatherings to share successful strategies	one planned for April, 2016.
		In response to a recognized need that more can be done to improve Aboriginal student success, the forthcoming Framework for Enhancing Student Learning will provide further opportunities for the Ministry to work directly with school districts that are not meeting with improved results for Aboriginal students. This may take the form, for example, of support teams being sent into districts to provide those districts with help in reaching the desired outcomes. Student results will be reported annually and publicly available.			
4.	Recommendation 4	The Ministry agrees with this	April 2016	Partially implemented-	Contractors have been procured and
	We recommend that the Ministry of Education evaluate the effectiveness	recommendation. While the Aboriginal student completion rate has climbed steadily since these strategies were		Enhancement Agreement review is under way.	review is being done on impact of Enhancement Agreements.
	of targeted funding and				Review of targeted funding is being

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
	enhancement agreements as strategies to close the gaps in education outcomes between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal students, and use the results to improve its policies to better support Aboriginal student outcomes.	introduced, a formal review could provide insights to better refine the related polices and more effectively promote best practices. Accordingly, a research study on the effectiveness of Aboriginal education enhancement agreements and future considerations toward systematic change was awarded October 1, 2015. This research is expected to be complete by April 2016. The results of this study will inform the direction of Aboriginal education enhancement agreements in the future. Furthermore, because of this recommendation, the Ministry will act on the recommendation related to funding to understand how it might be strategically used to better support learner outcomes.			explored.
5.	Recommendation 5 We recommend that the Ministry of	The Ministry agrees with this recommendation. The school completion certificate known as the	February 2016	Partially implemented	Student Credential Order change has been drafted to ensure Evergreen Certificates are limited to students who are designated

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
	Education work with boards of education to ensure School Completion Certificates are only granted to students who require a modified program due to a special need that prevents them from working toward graduation	Evergreen was intended to celebrate the efforts of students who had met learning goals other than graduation. While such recognition is important, the certificate was not intended to be awarded to students who could earn the Dogwood graduation certificate, and a disproportionately high number of Aboriginal students are receiving this non-graduation certificate. While a few districts are issuing the majority of these certificates, and the numbers of students in question is quite small, the practice cannot continue unchecked. Every student matters. Moreover, almost all students should be aiming for a graduation certificate and the entire system should be supporting them on that path.			Special Needs and on an Individual Education Program. Once draft change is approved, School Districts will be notified.
		Accordingly, the Ministry is actively reviewing the use of School Leaving Certificates with the intent to limit its use as originally intended in the near future.			
		Furthermore, the Ministry will consider this recommendation in the broader			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		context of its education transformation efforts. In other words, the Ministry is committing to work with all education partners to ensure that all students graduate with the necessary skills and knowledge to reach their potential in school and life.			
6.	Recommendation 6 We recommend that the Ministry of	The Ministry agrees with the recommendation, and for the Province	June, 2016	Fully implemented- Provide a Non-	Announced in June, 2015. School Districts to implement in 2015-16 school year.
	Education collaborate with boards of education and Aboriginal leaders and communities to:	this is a priority. In short, BC is dedicated to ensuring that the cultures and contributions of Aboriginal peoples		Instructional Day for teachers to address Aboriginal education	Ministry to follow up with School Districts on how the day was used.
	-provide all students with a curriculum that addresses the past and present effects of the colonization of Aboriginal people in British Columbia -address obstacles	in our province are reflected in all provincial curricula. We are proud of the progress we have made in the area. The work began in 2013 and is well aligned with the	September, 2016	Partially implemented- Kindergarten to Grade 9 curriculum completed. Full implementation begins in September	
	to ensuring safe, non-racist, culturally relevant learning environments through teacher professional development, cultural awareness training, and strategies to	subsequent recommendations made by the Truth and Reconciliation to jurisdictions across the country. First, during the recent and ongoing education transformation process, the	On-going, full implementation September 2017	Partially implemented- Grade 10-12 curriculum drafts going through consultation and review phases.	Drafts developed and posted for feedback. Review and phase two in planning stages.
	hire the best people to work with Aboriginal students	Ministry has ensured that there is Aboriginal expertise on each of the	April, 2016	Partially implemented- Research project on anti-	Procurement completed. Report due April.

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		subject area development teams, to embed Aboriginal perspectives and knowledge throughout the redesigned curriculum, and to reflect the First Peoples Principles of Learning in this redesign. Ministry curriculum revision teams were mandated with ensuring that the history and legacy of residential schools be included throughout the new provincial curriculum, from an Aboriginal perspective.		racism	
		Second, a resource document entitled "Aboriginal Worldviews and Perspectives in the Classroom—Moving Forward" was released by the Ministry to help educators embed culturally relevant learning into each student's experience. This resource reflects the voices of Aboriginal leaders, teachers, community members, students, and education partners including First Nations Education Steering Committee.			
		And, a third example: announced in June 2015, the non-instructional day for the 2015/16 school year was dedicated			

	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
	to Aboriginal education. School districts will use that day to better understand how to integrate Aboriginal content into the curriculum and how they might better support Aboriginal student achievement. (Note: this will reach existing teachers; in an effort to ensure that new teachers have a foundational understanding of Aboriginal content, teacher training programs in BC have already included Aboriginal content as a requirement for graduation.)			
	As a further and future response to this recommendation, the Ministry will consider how it might promote other tools available to boards of education. For example, the hiring of teachers is within the exclusive jurisdictional authority of each board and many but not all have taken advantage of Human Rights Tribunal exemptions to hire Aboriginal teachers and other professionals with Aboriginal ancestry.			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		with the First Nations Education Steering Committee, will be managing a research project on racism in BC schools. The research will provide recommendations on how the Ministry's ERASE strategy can be more effective specific to racism against Aboriginal students. ERASE training has been provided to school district personnel over the last number of years to ensure that a safe learning environment is provided for all students.			
7.	Recommendation 7 We recommend that the Ministry of Education collaborate with boards of education and Aboriginal leaders and communities to define and implement standardized monitoring and assessment of key indicators of Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal students' progress at key stages throughout their school career.	The Ministry agrees that key indicators spanning K-12 are an invaluable tool. Accordingly, it currently provides school district and provincial-level data on Aboriginal student performance indicators at various grades. This data is used in monitoring and annual reporting at all levels. Also in relation to this recommendation, the Ministry has already recognized that the accountability framework had	On-going September 2016	Fully implemented- Providing School Districts with student achievement data and trends Partially implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	Ministry provides school districts with data through a protected sharepoint, releases data publicly on Ministry website. As part of the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, work is underway with districts, Aboriginal leaders, and education partners to identify effective evidence that can be used at the district, regional, and provincial levels to improve student

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		become less informative despite being reporting intensive, and so the Ministry			learning, including a specific focus on Aboriginal students.
		is collaboratively implementing a new framework with a cross section of K-12 sector partners including FNESC and the BC School Trustees Association. The selection of appropriate and informative indicators is part of this collaborative effort and these indicators must be such that action can be taken to ensure each student is meeting with success. The Ministry has committed to including specific reporting on indicators of aboriginal student success as part of the new framework Further, the Ministry will keep this recommendation front of mind when working with all partner groups to build for the education system a new assessment framework: one that reflects the goals of education transformation.			This winter and spring, districts are developing processes for implementing the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, including a specific focus on reporting on the success of Aboriginal students. Included in this work is a focussed discussion on assessment evidence (classroom, district, provincial) that has been most effective in supporting student learning. Discussion on evidence and data to be used to support the Framework are ongoing with districts, education partners, and Aboriginal leaders. An initial provincial and district prototype report of key performance indicators has been developed by the ministry and has been shared with provincial education partners. Discussions on the specific data to be included in this provincial and district-level report are ongoing and will be informed by regional and district

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
					discussions that are currently underway.
8.	Recommend that the Ministry of Education establish responsibility within the ministry for developing a systematic approach to data analysis on Aboriginal student achievement.	The Ministry agrees that data is best managed in a systemic way and that more can be done in this regard. Under the new provincial Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, the Ministry will implement a more focussed approach for data analysis and reporting that is directly tied to province-wide continuous improvement efforts. System-wide strategies for analyzing and interpreting local data are a key part of the new framework, and include such things as the development of school- and district-based rubrics and analytic tools connected to BC's student information system. In addition, the Ministry is developing a systematic approach to evaluate educational program outcomes and student achievement, and will establish specific responsibilities in the Ministry in this regard.	September 2016	Partially implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	As part of the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, work is underway with districts to identify effective data that can be used at the district, regional, and provincial levels to improve student learning, including a specific focus on Aboriginal students. The results of this work will be shared with and discussed with education partners this spring through the Framework's provincial advisory group. Annual provincial meetings are planned with districts across the province to discuss evidence and strategies for enhancing student learning; planning for the first meeting has begun and is tentatively planned for April 2016.

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		As an additional response to this recommendation, in consultation with education partners, the Ministry will produce a public report of key provincial evidence for the province, each district and, as appropriate, for particular groups of districts; on all indicators. This will include reporting of specific results for Aboriginal students.			
		As part of their annual planning and reporting efforts, districts will be expected to make use of both local and provincial evidence and will be required by a Ministerial Order to report annually on Aboriginal student outcomes.			
9.	Recommendation 9 We recommend that the Ministry of Education use the evidence from its data analysis to inform ministry decision-making and clarify its expectations of boards of education	The Ministry completely supports this recommendation and is taking deliberate action in this regard. The Ministry will add resources and develop more effective evaluation procedures to evaluate the impact of ministry decisions and programs, and further inform ministry decision-making with respect to improving student		Partially implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	In October 2015, the ministry presented to all board chairs, superintendents, and secretary treasurers across the province, a draft Framework for Enhancing Student Learning. Work will continue with education partners this year to develop a final policy document by May 2016 that outlines expectations of boards of education for full implementation in the

Rec. #	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		outcomes.			2016/17 school year.
		Through multiple accountability and communication strategies (e.g., accountabilities with respect to student achievement, funding, and reporting, and regular conference calls and written communications with trustees and superintendents), the ministry will work to better outline its expectations of boards of education based on available evidence.			
		As part of the new provincial Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, the Ministry and its education partners will continue to work together in 2015/16 to clarify and implement province-wide expectations with respect to student learning. This includes a system-wide focus on students' intellectual, human, social, and career development; multi-year district and school planning for continuous improvement; reporting meaningful and effective evidence at least annually by districts and the province; system-wide			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		capacity building to enhance student learning; and, linkages with existing local agreements to ensure the consistent and meaningful support of Aboriginal students.			
10.	Recommendation 10 We recommend that the Ministry of Education support superintendents in their work with boards of education, staff, Aboriginal leaders and communities, and other districts to develop capacity to use data and evidence to plan for Aboriginal student achievement.	The Ministry agrees with this recommendation and will take action to further support superintendents in this regard. Through secondees working directly with school district staff, workshops focused on data analysis, and responses to district reports to the Ministry, school districts have received support to increase their capacity to analyze and plan, and this important work will continue. As part of an initial capacity-building and implementation strategy for the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, the Ministry is working with the BC School Superintendents Association and its chapters to develop and share capacity in evidence-based		Partially implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	As part of the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, work is underway in districts and regions across the province to develop processes for involving local education partners in the development of meaningful and effective school district and school plans. System-wide capacity building, including team-based supports focussed on continuous improvement and supporting Aboriginal student success, is a key focus of this work. Regional meetings are currently underway and will be completed by March 2016. Districts will post their planning processes by the end of March 2016. Through the provincial advisory group for enhancing student learning and planned annual provincial meetings to support the Framework, provincial education partners will be involved in the review of available

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		planning and to involve their local education partners, including boards of education, staff, and Aboriginal community members, in the planning process.		data and will help inform priorities and actions to improve student learning.	
	win ef lo ac Al le	Under the new Framework, the Ministry will also work with all education partners in 2015/16 to identify meaningful and effective evidence, both provincial and local, that can inform district plans and actions for improving achievement for Aboriginal students, and for enhancing learning for each student in BC's K-12 education system.			
11.	Recommendation 11 We recommend that the Ministry of Education collaborate with boards of education, superintendents, Aboriginal leaders and communities to define and implement expectations for regular provincial and district reporting on: Aboriginal student (on- and off-reserve, First Nations, Métis and	The Ministry agrees that reporting is essential to the education system, and an essential part of being accountable to British Columbians. Accordingly, the Ministry has collected data on self-identified Aboriginal students since 1991, and, since 1998/99, it has published an annual report called Aboriginal Report—How Are We Doing? to help the public school		Partially implemented- Framework for Enhancing Student Learning	As part of the Framework for Enhancing Student Learning, the ministry communicated in October 2015 a clear expectation that the province and districts will report at least annually on overall student results, as well as results for Aboriginal students, children in care, and students with special needs. Discussions are underway with boards of education, superintendents, Aboriginal leaders, and

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
	Inuit) achievement	system serve Aboriginal students.		-	communities regard the specific content of
	progress in meeting targets to close the gaps	At the same time, the Ministry agrees that there is room for improvement in			these reports.
	effectiveness of strategies for Aboriginal students.	the area of reporting: specifically, the Ministry and education system as a whole can better connect reporting to responses that help each student reach his or her full potential. Accordingly, the Ministry continues to work with provincial education partners to improve accountability in BC's K-12 education system. Boards of education, superintendents, Aboriginal leaders and community members, principals and vice-principals, secretary treasurers, teachers, parents, students, special educators, and the Office of the Representative for Children and Youth have all played important roles in shaping our provincial directions, resulting in the development of a draft Framework for Enhancing Student Learning.			
		This means that, in line with this recommendation, future school years			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		will have a different look. For example, key components of this new framework (which will be used in draft form in 2015/16 and refined as needed in May 2016) are multi-year district and school plans, updated annually, and meaningful and effective evidence to improve student outcomes. Under this framework, districts and the province will be expected to report at least annually on overall results, as well as Aboriginal students, children in care, and students with special needs. District plans will be expected to reflect local efforts to support each student, as well as to continuously improve outcomes for these groups of students.			
		Furthermore, another key component of this new framework is system-wide capacity building through team-based supports. The Ministry will work with its education partners to better utilize existing structures (e.g., regional and provincial partner meetings, non-instructional days, etc.) to discuss and			

Rec.	OAG Recommendations ¹	Action Planned	Target Date	Assessment of Progress by Entity ²	Action Taken ³
		promote effective practices for Aboriginal students. It will also work with its education partners to build new team-based supports to act on provincial and local priorities and needs (e.g., a provincial success team focussed on Aboriginal learners).			

Prepared by Ministry of Education

Please provide your email response to:
Attention: Bruce Ralston, Chair of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts
Email: Kate.Ryan-Lloyd@leg.bc.ca, Deputy Clerk and Clerk of Committees
Cc email to: the Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca