Audit of the Evergreen Line Rapid Transit Project Released March 2013

http://www.bcauditor.com/pubs

PAC Meeting Plan ¹	[19/11/13]	Prepared by: Doug Shephard, Treasury Board Staff	Reviewed by: Sabine Feulgen, Deputy Secretary to Treasury Board
1 st APPA Update	[04/11/14]	Prepared by: Heather Hill, Treasury Board Staff	Reviewed by: George Farkas, Deputy Secretary to Treasury Board
2 nd APPA Update	[13/11/17]	Prepared by: Heather Hill, Treasury Board Staff	Reviewed by: David Galbraith, Secretary to Treasury Board
3 rd APPA Update	[02/26/19]	Prepared by: Heather Hill, Treasury Board Staff	Reviewed by: Heather Wood, Secretary to Treasury Board
4 th APPA Update	[02/26/20]	Prepared by: Heather Hill, Treasury Board Staff	Reviewed by: Heather Wood, Secretary to Treasury Board

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

¹ The audited organization will be required to present their initial action plan at this meeting (i.e. First three columns completed for each OAG recommendation included in the audit report) Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ² Recommendations Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
---	--

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

² For each recommendation, the audited organization should state whether or not they have accepted the recommendation and plan to implement it fully by typing either "Yes" or "No" under the number of the recommendation.

³ Target date is the date that audited organization expects to have "fully or substantially implemented" the recommendation. If several actions are planned to implement one recommendation, indicate target dates for each if they are different.

⁴The Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) will request that the audited organization provide a yearly update (i.e completed "Assessment of Progress and Actions Taken" column) until all recommendations are fully implemented or otherwise addressed to the satisfaction of the PAC. This is for the APPA update.

⁵ This action plan and the subsequent updates have not been audited by the OAG. However, at a future date that Office may undertake work to determine whether the entity has implemented the recommendations. The results of that work will be reported in a separate report prepared by the OAG.

The Ministry of Finance implement a project plan, describing the scope, required resources, timelines and deliverables, for updating the Capital **Asset Management** Framework (CAMF) to

agencies on:

The information required to underpin capital project planning and how this should be documented; and

provide comprehensive

guidance for public sector

The type of oversight that should be applied to verify the information presented to government.

- The Ministry of Finance will continue to work through the Deputy Minister's Industry Infrastructure Forum (DMIIF) to implement priority initiatives related to CAMF, including releasing updated best-practice guidance documents and creating new documents.
- The ministry continues to progress work on the update of the CAMF and reviews the project plan as needed.
- The revision of CAMF will include guidance on the information required in planning a capital project, documentation needed and the due diligence required on information presented to government, likely as part of the update of the planning and governance chapters.
- Tools are being developed to supplement the planning chapter including concept plan and business case guidance, including service delivery options analysis.

Target Date: 2020

Progress Assessment: Partially implemented

Actions Taken & Discussion:

- Representatives from the construction industry and the provincial government have been working together through the Deputy Ministers and Industry Infrastructure Forum (DMIIF) to review capital procurement practices and current policy direction.
- DMIIF provides support for consolidated input from, and engagement with, industry. The Ministry of Finance works with the CAMF subcommittee of DMIIF to implement priority initiatives related to CAMF.
- As a result of that work, the Province implemented a number of best practice guidance documents under the CAMF: Pre-qualification Processes, Privilege Clauses, Guidance for the Release of Information &/or Documents Related to Competitive Procurement Opportunities, Concept Plan Guidance and a Capital Projects Documentation Retention Checklist.
- Implementation of the project plan for the update of CAMF has begun with the approval and release of best practices guidance documents mentioned above under the "tools and resources" sections. In addition, revisions of the procurement and financing chapters are underway and nearing completion.
- In addition, the business case guidance document that includes direction on strategic options analysis is expected to be completed and released in 2020. The concept plan guidance is also being revised to ensure consistency with the business case guidance.
- The revision of CAMF will include guidance on the information required in planning a capital project, documentation needed and the due diligence required on information presented to government, particularly as part of the update of the planning and governance chapters.
- Treasury Board Staff have added staff resources to the CAMF update project and have completed the following pieces of work since the last APPA update:
 - Moved the CAMF content from a static pdf file to an online format, making the guidance easier to use and searchable.
 - Business Case Guidance document feedback has been incorporated and is in the final review and
 - Jurisdictional review of service delivery options analysis completed, recommendations implemented in the business case guidance.
 - Best Practice Guidance on release of information guidance is being revised in consultation with CITZ and the construction industry.
 - Updates to the project documentation and the documentation retention checklist guidance completed
 - Incorporation of legal review of procurement chapter is underway, contingent on changes to the procurement section of the Core Policy and Procedures Manual.
 - Completion of CAMF sub-committee project to produce supplementary general conditions collaboratively between government and industry for the CCDC construction management contracts.

As the update of CAMF is an ongoing project, the project plan is reviewed and revised internally as needed.

Please provide your email response to:

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
6. Yes	The Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure, and Partnerships British Columbia improve how they assess and report on whether strategic options assessments and business cases have followed CAMF guidelines.	The Ministry of Finance plans to review guidelines for strategic options assessments and business cases during the update of the planning section of CAMF, including the development of tools as needed (e.g. scalable business case guidance document). Target Date: 2020	Actions Taken & Discussion: Internal Partnerships BC business case development guidelines are based on CAMF, and as business cases are reviewed by Ministries, PBC and Finance, consideration is given to whether CAMF principles have been met. Ministry of Finance reviews of business cases, including strategic options analysis provided by agencies, are aligned with the principles in CAMF and reported through TBS briefing notes prepared for the advice of Treasury Board. Strategic options analysis, also called service delivery options analysis, is a key component of a project concept plan. A concept plan guidance document has been completed and is available under the tools section of the CAMF https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/governments/services-for-government/internal-corporate-services/camf . In addition, a jurisdictional scan of best practices for service delivery options analysis has been completed by TBS and was used to inform the final business case guidance document. A draft business case guidance document has been developed in consultation with key stakeholders and is expected to be finalized and released in 2020. The concept plan guidance is also being updated to better align with the content of the business case guidance in respect of service delivery options analysis and the recommendations from the jurisdictional scan. The planning chapter of CAMF will also be updated accordingly in due course.

Email: Comptroller General's Office of the Government of British Columbia Comptroller.General@gov.bc.ca