Oversight of Physician Services Released 02/14

http://www.bcauditor.com30/09/14/pubs

PAC Meeting Plan ¹	30/09/14	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Ted Patterson, Assistant Deputy Minister
1 st APPA Update	18/09/15	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Ted Patterson, Assistant Deputy Minister
2 nd APPA Update	30/11/16	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Ted Patterson, Assistant Deputy Minister
3 rd APPA Update	17/11/17	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Mark Armitage, Assistant Deputy Minister
4 th APPA Update	29/03/19	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Mark Armitage, Assistant Deputy Minister
5 th APPA Update	20/02/20	Prepared by: Rod Frechette, Ministry of Health	Reviewed by: Mark Armitage, Assistant Deputy Minister

Rec. # OAG Accepted? Yes / No² Recommendations

Actions Planned & Target Date(s)³

Assessment of Progress to date⁴ and Actions Taken⁵ (APPA update)

Please provide your email response to:

¹ The audited organization will be required to present their initial action plan at this meeting (i.e. First three columns completed for each OAG recommendation included in the audit report)

² For each recommendation, the audited organization should state whether or not they have accepted the recommendation and plan to implement it fully by typing either "Yes" or "No" under the number of the recommendation.

³ Target date is the date that audited organization expects to have "fully or substantially implemented" the recommendation. If several actions are planned to implement one recommendation, indicate target dates for each if they are different.

⁴The Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) will request that the audited organization provide a yearly update (i.e completed "Assessment of Progress and Actions Taken" column) until all recommendations are fully implemented or otherwise addressed to the satisfaction of the PAC. This is for the APPA update.

⁵ This action plan and the subsequent updates have not been audited by the OAG. However, at a future date that Office may undertake work to determine whether the entity has implemented the recommendations. The results of that work will be reported in a separate report prepared by the OAG.

Rec. #OAGAccepted? Yes / No2RecommendationsAccepted? Accepted?Actions Planned & Target Date(s)3	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
1 YesWe recommend that the Ministry of Health work with the College of 	CPOC.

Please provide your email response to:

	 A roadmap that describes how the technical infrastructure will be developed to collect and share the selected measures has been prepared. The measures will be available to individual physicians about their practice, and government will have access to aggregated measures reports. The MSPQI Steering Committee, supported by the Secretariat provided by the BC Patient Safety & Quality Council, has completed the Final Phase 1 Report for submission to Leadership Council and board of the Doctors of BC. Pending approval from these groups, Phase 2 of the MSPQI initiative will proceed.

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
	1.4 use the information for the defined	Target Date: The BCMQI will be formally launched in September 2015.	
	measures and targets, as part of the	Implementation of C&P system began in April 2015 and continue in 2016.	
	as part of the performance review process, to evaluate the quality and cost- effectiveness of physician services across BC and identify areas of improvement; 1.5 report results at an aggregate level so the Legislative Assembly and the public understand whether the services being provided are achieving value for money; and 1.6 require all physicians to participate in the	Development of a system of performance measures and targets for medical specialties and sub-specialties will take place over the next three years.	
	process.		

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
2. Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Health, the health authorities, the Medical Services Commission and the College of Physicians and Surgeons of British Columbia, in consultation with the British Columbia Medical Association, clarify: 2.1 the roles and accountabilities for ensuring that the health system supports quality and cost-effective physician services; and 2.2 the relationship and accountability of individual physicians to Government for the quality and cost- effectiveness of their services.	The Ministry's strategic planning guide document, Setting Priorities for the BC Health System, identifies as a key priority that the Ministry will establish a clear performance management accountability framework built on public reporting, and include role clarity and accountability mechanisms for the Ministry of Health, health authorities, physicians, nurses and allied health professional and support staff focused on population and patient needs. The Ministry will work with stakeholders on an ongoing basis to develop this role clarity and accountability, including specifically with respect to oversight for physician services. Target Date: Ongoing	 Substantially implemented Update 29/03/19 and ongoing: Roles and accountabilities continue to be clarified in a number of ways, including for example: Ongoing discussions between government, health authorities, physician representatives and other partners in a number of forums, such as joint collaborative committees under the Physician Master Agreement; Continued efforts to improve accountability of joint collaborative committees through improving the oversight function provided by the Physician Services Commission (MSC) and Ministry staff to clarify roles and responsibilities and increase the visibility of the MSC and enhance the level of support provided by the Ministry to the MSC; The Ministry communicating clear expectations to HAs in terms of their role in managing physician resources, particularly through the Provincial Medical Services Executive Council and its Physician Compensation Working Group; Enhancement of the role of the Physician Services Secretariat, housed at the Health Employers Association of BC, in terms of supporting the Ministry and HAs in terms of more effectively managing physician resource issues and taking provincial approaches on significant negotiation issues; etc. Through the new Physician Master Agreement, the MSC advisory committees - Guidelines and Protocols Advisory Committee (GPAC) and Patterns of Practice Committee (PPC) - will work more closely together including on-going joint review of GPAC guidelines. Additionally, PPC will complement new GPAC guidelines with related educational material and will review impacts on utilization; and, the joint collaborative committee mandates will be updated so that they provide input to the work and effectiveness of GPAC and PPC.

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
3. Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Health and the health authorities, in consultation with the British Columbia Medical Association and other health system partners, rebuild physician compensation models so they align with the delivery of high-quality, cost-effective physician services.	 In support of the Ministry's strategic agenda for the health system, the Ministry will strategically and opportunistically identify opportunities to work in collaboration with our health system partners to develop and implement new and innovative compensation models to better support the <i>Triple Aim</i> objective of: Improving the health of populations; Improving the patient experience of care (including quality and satisfaction), to which B.C. has added the requirement of improving the experience of delivering care for providers and support staff; and, Reducing the per capita cost of health by focusing on quality (especially effectiveness and appropriateness) and the efficiency of health care delivery. Target Date: Ongoing 	 Substantially implemented Update 20/02/20: The Ministry continues to actively pursue opportunities to work with HAs and physicians to develop new compensation models and incentives in support of Ministry priorities for the health system. In support of the Ministry's Primary Care Strategy, particularly implementation of the Primary Care Network (PCN), service contract templates were developed to engage physicians and Nurse Practitioners who are interested in establishing a family practice and building patient panels. The Ministry is currently developing a service contract template that will be offered to established General Practitioners in approved PCNs in early 2020/21. A new incentive based, group accountability service contract for anesthesiologists, to support increased surgeries. The Ministry has developed a draft Alternate Payment Program Framework to guide decision on when to enter into Agreements Then Ministry is launching the APP Transformation Initiative in 2020/21. This project will improve the data information/quality and interface between the health authorities and the Ministry with respect to the effective and efficient management of the provincial APP budget. Compensation options that better support team-based care than fee-for-service are being offered to practitioners in approved PCN communities. The Ministry continues work on Population Based Funding (blended capitation) models to enable expansion of the program across the province in 2020/21. As well, foundation work is being undertaken on the Northern Model, currently being piloted in Fort St. John, to enable expansion to Prince George. The Ministry and the Doctors of BC, through the GPSC Incentive Working Group, have created and implemented a new financial payment to full service family physicians that supports panel management (i.e. EMR and file data clean up/organization, clinical quality improvement to improve patient care)

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
4. Yes	We recommend that as long as fee-for-service and alternative payment remain significant funding models for physician services in British Columbia: 4.1 the Ministry of Health should ensure that it has the degree of influence necessary to align funding with health system priorities; 4.2 fees and contracts are adjusted on a regular basis so	The Ministry will refresh its organizational structure and capacity to ensure the effective management of physician compensation policies and programs. Target Date: June 2017	 Fully implemented <u>Update 29/03/19:</u> A Compensation Policy and Programs Branch (CPPB) was created in July 2015 and assumed oversight for all physician compensation policy and programs in the Ministry, which were previously managed across a number of different parts of the organization. A subsequent reorganization occurred in 2018 to ensure adequate and appropriate focus on work required to support the Ministry's Strategic Priorities. The Ministry has also increased its capacity in the area of health human resource economics and analytics and consolidated its analytical resources within a single division. The Doctors of BC, through the Physician Services Committee, have acknowledged the need to align funding with the Ministry's priorities.

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
	physician compensation reflects changes in the knowledge, skills, time and technology required to deliver a service; and 4.3 the health authorities adhere to negotiated ranges and rates, work as one entity to negotiate expectations, and document the rationale for any non-adherence to negotiated ranges and rates.	The Ministry will conduct a high-level review of health authority physician human resource management structures, processes and capacity as well as the role of the Health Employers' Association of BC (HEABC) in supporting effective physician human resource management. Target Date: November 2015	 Fully implemented Update 20/02/20: Through the Provincial Health Workforce Planning Process, established in 2016/17, the Ministry works collaboratively with health authorities to ensure that the supply, mix and distribution of physicians and the broader health workforce is aligned with patient and population health needs across BC. As part of this process, the Ministry has clearly defined and communicated expectations for health authorities through policy and detailed instructions. As a result of this collaborative work, the Provincial Health Workforce Strategy 2018/19-2020/21 was released in April 2018. In recent years, health authorities have increased their corporate capacity to engage in physician workforce planning. The Ministry supports this work and is actively addressing data gaps and other barriers at the health system level. In 2019/20, the Ministry and Health Authorities embarked on a new provincial health workforce planning cycle. A clear focus of this work was aligning health authority workforce planning with provincial-level strategic direction and ensuring cross-system plans are in place to address the highest priority issues and challenges. The Provincial Health Workforce Strategy is being updated to reflect this work. The Ministry continues to maximize the HEABC Physician Services Secretariat to provide the Ministry and HAs with more capacity to manage local, regional and provincial physician resource issues in a more effective and consistent way.

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
		The Ministry will review and refresh its major compensation policies and programs (including administration of these policies and programs), starting with Alternative Payments Program (APP) and followed by the Medical Services Commission Payment Schedule (Fee for Service). Fee Item review methodology and process to be completed by December 2017, including preliminary analysis of internal relativity of core codes. APP Policy and Administrative reviews to be completed by December 2015. Implementation of changes to APP will occur in 2016.	 Substantially implemented <u>Update 29/03/19 and ongoing:</u> The Ministry completed a review of Medical Services Commission Payment Schedule and its fee codes across all specialties based on a relative comparison of price per unit of time. Based on that review and its findings, and pursuant to the Physician Master Agreement, Article 12.2(a), the Ministry advised the Doctors of BC Tariff Committee of its recommendations to reduce five fee codes (in ophthalmology and cardiology). The Tariff Committee recommended reductions to two of the ophthalmology codes which were implemented October 1, 2018. The cardiology fee code along with concerns about how different cardiologists were billing add-on fees lead the section of cardiology to rewrite portions of their fee schedule which received approval at Tariff Committee on March 15, 2019. The Ministry also continues with a number of efforts to improve administration of the Alternative Payments Program, including: Improvements to Ministry and HA business processes; Strengthening the role of HEABC Physician Services Secretariat in managing physician contract issues, including creations through the Provincial Medical Services Executive Council and its Physician Compensation Working Group on approaches to managing physician compensation issues; Development of provincial negotiation principles/parameters for key physician groups; Recent settlement of long-standing dispute between the Ministry and Doctors of BC regarding pay rates for physicians on APP, which should provide clarity and lead to less conflict on these matters in the future; etc.
			 The recently concluded Physician Master Agreement Negotiations include: Improvements to the APP template contracts and the creation of a new group template service contract Provisions to measure and address workload of physicians under APP contracts Targeted Service Contract and Salary Agreement Increases to address 'equity' and after hours Introduction of a new 90 day physician consultation process for government when developing new non-fee-for-service compensation models.

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
5. Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Health work with the health authorities, in consultation with the British Columbia Medical Association, to: 5.1 identify work environment barriers to physician engagement; 5.2 develop and implement a plan to improve the organizational culture between administrators and physicians so the focus is on delivering high- quality, cost effective services that meet both individual patient and population health needs; 5.3 identify and implement performance measures and targets to evaluate physician engagement; 5.4 monitor and evaluate progress in addressing areas requiring improvements; and 5.5 report the results to physicians and health administrators.	The Ministry of Health, Health Authorities and Doctors of BC will work collaboratively to improve the relationship between physicians working in health authority programs and facilities and health authority administrators. Target Date: Ongoing - 2014 through 2019.	 Substantially implemented Update 20/02/20: The Ministry of Health continues to engage and work constructively on health care policy issues with physicians, health authorities and other partners through the joint collaborative committees. In terms of family physicians, the Ministry has worked extensively with its partners through the General Practice Services Committee in 2017 to shape up and gain consensus around a new provincial policy direction for primary and community care. These efforts have included reinforcing local relationships between family physicians and health authorities through Collaborative Services Committees consisting of individual Divisions of Family Practice and HAs, as well as Inter-Divisional Strategic Councils, consisting of regional representation from Divisions and HAs. In terms of facility-based physicians, the Ministry, health authorities and physicians continue to work through the Specialist Services Committee on a provincial engagement initiative. The initiative was established through a Memorandum of Agreement on Regional and Local Engagement as part of the 2014-19 Physician Master Agreement and was renewed in the 2019-22 Physician Master Agreement. The initiative is supported by annual funding from the Ministry intended to support improved relationships between local Medical Staff Associations and HAs. Medical Staff Associations receive funds once they are organized to receive and manage the funds. There are presently 72 of 75 local sites approved for full funding to carry out engagement related activities with the HAs. The Doctors of BC conducts an annual member survey that includes measures of engagement from the Accreditation Canada's Physician Worklife Pulse Tool. These survey results are shared with Leadership Council, health authority leaders, and physicians. Additionally, the University of British Columbia (UBC) has been contracted to evaluate the process, outcomes, benefits and related costs

Please provide your email response to:

Rec. # Accepted? Yes / No ²	OAG Recommendations	Actions Planned & Target Date(s) ³	Assessment of Progress to date ⁴ and Actions Taken ⁵ (APPA update)
6. Yes	We recommend that the Ministry of Health: 6.1 work with the health authorities, health care facilities and the College of Physicians and Surgeons of British Columbia to identify regulatory framework barriers; 6.2 create and implement an action plan to address the barriers; and 6.3 work with the health authorities, facilities and the College of Physicians and Surgeons of British Columbia to ensure they are able to work collaboratively to maximize the quality and cost-effectiveness of patient care.	Recommendations for legislative and regulatory reform to be brought forward for consideration by government in 2018. In 2012, the former Physician Quality assurance Steering Committee (PQASC) commissioned a legal review of the legislative and regulatory framework governing physician services in BC. Work is underway to address barriers identified in the report. Target Date: Changes to Medical Staff Bylaws will be targeted for implementation in 2017.	 Partially implemented <u>Update 26/02/20</u>: The Ministry has engaged a number of partners in preliminary discussions on legislation and regulation governing physician services in the province. Based on these discussions, as well as policy work to date, a number of broader health system legislative and regulatory issues have been identified that may need to be addressed in order to refresh the Medical Staff Bylaws and address specific legislative and regulatory barriers raised in the OAG report. The Ministry continues to work with health authorities to make minor revisions to their medical staff bylaws to clarify that nurse practitioners are members of the medical staff. In July 2017 a draft policy paper emphasized the importance of positioning a more significant update of MSBs as part of a larger policy discussion respecting the medical governance framework (including the Hospital Act and Hospital Act Regulation) and additional work has been waiting further direction For 2020/21, the Ministry and the health authorities have asked Physician Services at HEABC to propose an approach on what specific sections of the Medical Staff bylaws should be amended. Once complete, the Provincial Medical Services Executive Council (PMSEC) will review the plan and discuss through Leadership Council the opportunity to move forward on the proposed changes.

Please provide your email response to: