

#### Commonwealth Youth Parliament

CY P8

November 6-10, 2016 Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

#### DEBATES OF THE

# EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

(HANSARD)

TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2016

Afternoon House Proceedings





The Honourable Linda Reid, Speaker

# LIEUTENANT-GOVERNOR OF THE COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Honourable Rick Hansen, CC, OBC			
SPEAKER OF THE COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT  Honourable Linda Reid			
LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY			
Craig James, Clerk of the House			
Mentors			
Spencer Chandra Herbert, MLALegislative Assembly of British ColumbiaKate Forbes, MSPScottish ParliamentJessica Littlewood, MLALegislative Assembly of AlbertaAdam Marshall, MPParliament of New South WalesChathura Sandeepa Senaratne, MPParliament of Sri LankaJodie Wickens, MLALegislative Assembly of British Columbia			
Observers			
Hosts of the Ninth Commonwealth Youth Parliament			
Honourable Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe, Speaker			
Commonwealth Parliamentary Association			
Akbar Khan. Secretary-General Lucy Pickles. Assistant Private Secretary to the Secretary-General Meenakshi Dhar Director of Programmes, CPA Secretariat Arlene Bussette Assistant Director of Programmes, CPA Secretariat Sahar Eljack Programmes Assistant, CPA Secretariat Shehana Udat Programmes Assistant, CPA Secretariat			

## EXECUTIVE COUNCIL AND PARLIAMENTARY OFFICERS

Hon. Ashvini Savanthrapadian			
Youth Parlia	AMENTARIANS		
David Akombwa Zambia Jody Aldridge Falkland Islands Sara Aslam Pakistan Barbara Ojone Awulu Nigeria Danish Bhutto Pakistan Rebecca Cross England Elise Delpiano Australia Zoé Duhaime Canada Laura Elliott Wales Gemma Finn Falkland Islands Davey Haughton Jamaica Nicholas Hawkes Isle of Man Sheridan Hawse Canada Farah Hussain England Dwaynifia Joseph Montserrat Jordan Kerr Australia Andriy Krugliak Canada Gabriel Laurence-Brook Canada Elizabeth Kite Tonga Alexia Lawrence St. Helena Island Honeylynn Lisson Australia Sky Losier Canada Arean Louis Turks and Caicos Jabari Lynch Trinidad and Tobago Essalene Martin Montserrat	Erin McAuley Scotland Aaron McDonnell Australia Jared Avanti McGill Cayman Islands Kareina Mohammed Trinidad and Tobago Mark Munnich Australia Jamie Murray Scotland Connor Mycroft Canada Oliver Nacey New Zealand Christine Wambui Ndiritu Kenya Tifwepo Nkunika Zambia Anne Shibuko Ogada Kenya Muhammad Sultan Owaisi India Stefanie Lynn Panesar Canada Sheldon Paul Canada Sonniel Pickering British Virgin Islands Avery Roberge-Eadie Canada Abbas Itopa Sanni Nigeria Ashvini Savanthrapadian New Zealand Dikeledi Terence Sekese South Africa Delisile Delcy Sithole South Africa Mackenzie Taylor Canada Monique Thomas Jamaica Josh Tordiff Canada Rea Vanterpool British Virgin Islands Robert Winspear Jersey		

#### Table of Contents

Tuesday, November 8, 2016 Afternoon House Proceedings

#### Routine Business

Introductions by Youth Parliamentarians	73
Introduction and First Reading of Bills Bill M202 — Devolution of Health Care Services Act	74
Orders of the Day	
Second Reading of Bills	76

#### TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2016

The House met at 3:03 p.m.

[Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe in the chair.]

#### **Routine Business**

### Introductions by Youth Parliamentarians

**Muhammad Owaisi:** It's my pleasure to introduce to you, and through you, Mr. Paul Campbell. Paul works in the Legislative Assembly of B.C. restaurant and is in charge of catering for all the members, staff and guests of the Legislature. He's the one who's been keeping us fed.

Paul tells me that he's enjoyed serving us our meals as much as we've enjoyed eating them. He enjoys the diversity and the energy that we've brought to this chamber. We have kept the whole catering team on their toes. I want to thank Paul for his continued service, and I ask that all the members of the House join me in extending the traditional warm welcome of this assembly.

**Arean Louis:** Greetings, my fellow parliamentarians. Today I stand to honour the mother of the Deputy Clerk of the House, Kate Ryan-Lloyd, as she celebrates her 80th birthday. We, the youth parliamentarians, would like to wish her a happy, happy birthday. However, we're not going to sing the *Happy Birthday* song. But we do wish her God's blessings, and may she live to see many, many more birthdays to come.

[1505]

Stefanie Panesar: I'd like to introduce David Spence, who gave us our lovely talk this lunch. He represents the Royal Commonwealth Society at the Vancouver Island branch. I myself am part of the Vancouver branch. He's also been part of the Vancouver branch. I think we can all appreciate the Royal Commonwealth Society, all being members of the Commonwealth ourselves.

As he was saying, when Will and Kate came here — last month, about — we had the Commonwealth Canopy. We're trying to get all our environment protected. I think that's something we can all strive towards. I'd like to send a very warm welcome to David Spence.

**Josh Tordiff:** Thank you very much for this opportunity to speak. Thank you, all my fellow parliamentarians, for their



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT acknowledgments and especially for the catering staff here and the wonderful lunch they provided us today.

I would like to start off by introducing myself. My name is Josh Tordiff. I'm from the Northwest Territories here in Canada. I was hoping to come to this event and learn from all of you. We're going to bring together a lot of unique perspectives on government and governing operations. I want to thank all of you, my fellow parliamentarians, for this opportunity.

We are here to teach and to learn. I would not have this opportunity if it wasn't for my grandparents, in specific. I would like to thank them and the government in the Northwest Territories — in specific, the Office of the Clerk — for this wonderful opportunity to be here with you all. I thank you.

Hon. Jordan Kerr: I request leave to call the introduction of bills.

Leave granted.

### **Introduction and First Reading of Bills**

### BILL M202 — DEVOLUTION OF HEALTH CARE SERVICES ACT

**Josh Tordiff:** I don't have the bill in front of me at this moment, but I would like to present a bit titled the Devolution of Health Care Services Act. I would also like the opportunity to find my notes so I can speak in specific to the details of the bill. At this moment, I don't have them in front of me.

However, this act was designed to decentralize the health care services currently provided within Commonwealthland. It is an act designed to allow for health care services to be provided at a local level, in a localized manner that is culturally holistic. As we probably all know, we have about 25 to 30 percent of the population of Commonwealthland identifying as a visible minority, with a sizable amount, around 5 percent of our population, identifying as aboriginal.

We were afforded questions earlier by the opposition in regards to the health care services provided throughout the Commonwealthland by this government. This bill was designed to localize those health care services in a cost-efficient manner that allows the government to approach the health care services that we provide currently, as I mentioned before, in a culturally holistic manner that is relevant to the local populations here in the Commonwealthland.

It is a cost-efficient measure, and it allows us to — as I brought up in a question yesterday — provide equal and fair services to all

citizens of the Commonwealthland.

I move that a bill titled the Devolution of Health Care Services Act, of which notice has been given in my name on the order paper, be introduced and now read for a first time.

Motion approved.

[1510]

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** I move that the bill be placed on the orders of the day for the second reading at the next sitting day after today.

Bill M202, Devolution of Health Care Services Act, introduced, read a first time and ordered to be placed on orders of the day for second reading at the next sitting of the House after today.

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** Madame Speaker, I further request leave to introduce a bill without notice.

Leave not granted.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Proceed, Member.

**Sky Losier:** I seek leave of the House to introduce a motion to suspend the standing orders and hold a 15-minute question period at this time so that the government can be further held to account by the opposition.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): I'm going to ask: Is leave granted?

Leave not granted.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Leave has not been granted, so the government may continue.

Interjections.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Members. Members.

The government has the floor.

#### Orders of the Day

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** I call the continued second reading of Bill 1, entitled Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act.



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

#### Tuesday, November 8, 2016 Victoria, British Columbia

#### **Second Reading of Bills**

#### BILL 1 — YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP AND INTERNSHIP ACT

(continued)

**Andriy Krugliak:** Good afternoon, Madame Speaker. I am pleased to rise in support of this bill.

This afternoon we've heard from the opposition party that our policies resemble those of countries like China, but that is totally not true. This bill is very much like the Young Canada Works program of one of our Commonwealth partners, Canada.

[1515]

There the federal government runs a program that provides grants to small business and institutions in the heritage sector and cultural sector that allows them to hire youth for the duration of the summer in order to provide them with employment and provide them with an opportunity to work throughout the summer. This would not be possible for those youths without the funding that the federal government in Canada provides to museums, cultural institutions and various other organizations. That is what this government is trying to do, and I am confident that this government will be able to achieve those goals.

Now, according to research from the University of Virginia, the decade between 20 and 30 are the most important years in a person's life. That's when most of the wage growth comes for a person. That's when most of the skills that a person gains come. It's in their 20s. Without employment during those years, it is typical that those without opportunities to get employment do not succeed as much as those that do get an opportunity to gain employment in their 20s.

This government is making sure that youth in our country get an opportunity to gain skills, to gain employment and to be successful in their futures. We are investing in our youth. We are investing in our future. The opposition doesn't seem to see that. It is important that this government act on their mistakes. It is important that this government invest in the future.

I have been personally privileged to have found employment at 14 and to have continued employment since then. It's been an opportunity for me to gain skills, to be aware of the opportunities that I have in my future, to be sure of what I want to do in the future. Without an opportunity to gain employment at 14 and going forward, I wouldn't have known what I want to do, and I wouldn't know what I enjoy. This government is providing opportunity to the youth in our country to have the same insight into their future.

I strongly support this bill, and I think all members in this House should do the same.

**Muhammad Owaisi:** The Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act before us is a very real issue for Commonwealthland. I partake in a mentorship program with young people, and I am aware of their concerns. However, I'm unsure if the government noticed that this act is too short. I mean, come on. It's only three pages. Did the government run out of paper?

I feel like the government wrote this on the back of one of Paul's restaurant napkins. The fact that there are no details validates our concern that the government is not taking youth employment seriously.

If they want us to trust them with taxpayers' money, money that will be going into covering the huge costs of this bill, we need more information and real transparency. To give the government carte blanche to pay for the grant program, we need more detail. The government should know better than to just throw money that belongs to Commonwealthland at problems that they haven't even shown us any real amount of research on. It just smacks of irresponsibility.

How do they know that they're not really creating a problem? How will they ever know if the training wheels are ready to come off without disaster? You have given us a bill where you refuse to detail what measures will be put in place, leaving us without our chance to represent our constituents in debating what the targets are and how you will measure success.

It is the minister's prerogative to make up....

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** Madame Speaker, the hon. member has been referring to the government as "you" in his speech. Thank you. [1520]

**Muhammad Owaisi:** It is the minister's prerogative to make up the regulations in shadow after this bill passes. As the government, it is your job and your duty to show us what your plan is. What is your plan?

#### **Point of Order**

Hon. Jordan Kerr: Madame Speaker, point of order.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Government Member, please proceed.

Hon. Jordan Kerr: Madame Speaker, can the hon. member



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT please continue to refer to yourself or to the government by its correct name?

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Hon. Member on the opposition, please be guided accordingly.

Muhammad Owaisi: Yes, Madame Speaker.

#### **Debate Continued**

**Muhammad Owaisi:** We'd just like to ask: what is the plan? That's it. That is it. What is the plan?

**Jody Aldridge:** I would just like to talk about how the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act is actually very important to me personally. I, myself, have benefited from a similar scheme in my own country — in the Falkland Islands.

We have a scheme which is called the career development scheme. This tries to improve the lives of the people who are status holders and permanent residency holders within the Falklands. They are able to gain better qualifications and go inside the jobs within the government and in the Falklands which would normally be taken by people from overseas.

This is vital for any community. This means we are improving our own people, our own youth, and giving them a better stance for the future. This means we're not relying on people from outside of our country. We can make sure that our children and our youths are able to put themselves forward and do the best that they can.

We're also extremely lucky to have a fully funded education system, which means that we are sent away to university and to college and don't have any student loans at the end of this. Again, this is to look after our children and our youth and invest in their future and our future.

This act is doing that completely, investing in the future, and that is vital to do.

**Jabari Lynch:** Any time and every time the opposition asks the government what is their plan, they simply shrug their shoulders and bury their heads in their laps. We are tired, and what we require from you this day is for you to be accountable and to answer.

Hon. Jordan Kerr: Same point of order.

Madame Speaker, can you please make firm with the opposition that they refer to the government by its correct term or refer to yourself as the Speaker?

**Jabari Lynch:** Madame Speaker, I believe that the government is right in what they're saying in terms of the point of order, though it is a one-trick pony.

As I was saying, and I will continue.... Youth entrepreneurship in Commonwealthland has accounted for more than 75 percent of the growth within the services industry, which is both the largest and the fastest-growing sector of our nation's GDP. That accounts for roughly one-quarter of the national GDP. This information, of course, is based on the government's statistics.

In fact, the government's self-described, well-thoughtout and comprehensive profile of the characteristics of the
Commonwealthland go on to list the main services industry. It
must be said that these youth entrepreneurs have created their own
enterprises and have not only made themselves very prevalent
within the services industry — especially information technology
— but also are very successful in the listed main industries and thus
are contributing to the national GDP in ways unprecedented.

Nothing has been said about entrepreneurship as a means to deal with unemployment in our nation. No, not everyone can be an entrepreneur. But the growth of our economy at this present time, shown by the government's statisticians, have clearly and explicitly outlined the fact that there is massive potential for young people to find their niche and to not only create sustainable businesses, services and exports but also to create jobs for their peers and for their countrymen.

[1525]

Instead, and contrary to popular and verified behavioural psychology from men like Abraham Maslow and others, we wish to lump all young people ages 15 to 35 into the category of labourer, apprentice or intern. And not only that. To incentivize this process by making the employers, whomever they be and however they may become an employer within the program, by giving them a grant....

The process is not fully thought-out, and the government should, as a matter of integrity, follow the lead of the opposition in creating an extragovernmental board to ensure that these grants are handed out responsibly.

I believe, and I'm beginning to believe, in accountability, something very alien to the government. They run and they hide from questions. I want to believe that the government came with a proper mandate, that they are not afraid, but I am beginning to believe the contrary.

Furthermore, there have been citizens that have come to me. Even organizations like Green Tomorrow are worried that certain mining companies and other industries have the first pickings of



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT youth labour. This surely cannot be the intention of the government. But it must never be implied in the slightest that this is the case, and of course, a monitoring body must be put in place, funded entirely apart from the government.

Within the constituency, I have found many young people who, because of their particular skillsets, cannot see themselves working for others and would, instead, rather employ and add to the national interest and, of course, increase the national GDP.

One such individual is Yvette Ingram, an Inuit young lady and information technology savant, who wishes, in the vein of Bill Gates, Steve Jobs and Mark Zuckerberg, to create the next billion dollar company right here, in Commonwealthland. But with policies from the government, she would either have to leave the nation, our beloved nation, to find greener pastures or be forced into a minimum-wage job, thus effectively killing her innovation and creativity. Imagine if an entrepreneurship incubation program was created.

Madame Speaker, as I wrap up, I thank you very much for this moment.

**Hon. Sara Aslam:** The opposition asked us to follow their lead, and I'm sorry to decline that offer, because, frankly speaking, it has resulted in many, many problems. The reality is that we have inherited a 6 percent unemployment rate, thanks to them. We have also inherited hurdles to relieving this. And that is through an annual fee of \$5,000 Canadian for university students.

The intention behind the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act is, therefore, to close the gaps left by the opposition. Many of my constituents have been or are unemployed because of the opposition. This has resulted in a cycle of depression, drug abuse, homelessness and many other problems, including health problems.

The aim of this bill is, therefore, multifold. First, to give citizens a sense of hope. Second, to give them practical experience and to prepare them for work. Third, to maximize their chances of a good life and income which, again, the opposition denied them. Therefore, I am delighted that we have a draft bill, and I back my government 100 percent.

Elise Delpiano: First of all, I wish to remind the government that, in fact, Commonwealthland is a new country, a new parliament. If the government cared to open their brief to tab 4, they would see that, in fact, we are a new parliament and that the government did not inherit their problems from the opposition but are instead creating them for themselves.

#### **Point of Order**

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** I'd just like to make a clarification that, according to the paperwork with which we have been presented regarding Commonwealthland, a new parliament has been formed.

I just wish to clarify that with the opposition. A new parliament has been formed. The country has existed for a few years, if you continue reading beyond point 4.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Thank you.

Leader of the Opposition, you may proceed.

Elise Delpiano: Madame Speaker, I apologize.

#### **Debate Continued**

Elise Delpiano: However, Madame Speaker, if the government cared to read tab 4 of the brief, regardless of whether we are a new country or not, there is nothing here to state that the opposition have passed on the problems that our great land currently faces to the government. These were multiparty elections that created a new parliament. Therefore, we are a new political party, and you did not inherit it from us.

Nonetheless, if this government continues to live in a dream, like it does with the rest of its utopian policies, go ahead. But nothing will ever happen.

Madame Speaker, to the point. I wish to talk in respect of the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act, which has been placed before us by this government.

Interjections.

#### **Point of Order**

**Andriy Krugliak:** The suggestion of misrepresentation or falsehood is unparliamentary within this House. The member of the opposition party is suggesting that this government has lied to this House.

Interjection.

**Andriy Krugliak:** Here we go, yet again — another proof that this member is suggesting that we are lying to this House, which is unparliamentary.

I ask that you demand that this opposition member withdraw her comments.



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Thank you, Member.

Lying is unparliamentary language. Members, kindly note.

**Sky Losier:** A point of order on the point of order, Madame Speaker.

If I can explain, and then perhaps it's not well-taken.... During making his point of order, the hon. member down the way did not refer to the hon. Leader of the Opposition by her proper title. Pursuant to Standing Order 8, that is a breach.

**Andriy Krugliak:** I addressed the hon. member as the member of the opposition party. That is completely acceptable within this House.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Member, she is the Leader of the Opposition, so you need to note that, accordingly.

Proceed.

#### **Debate Continued**

**Elise Delpiano:** With respect to the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act proposed by the government, I wish to make a few comments as the Leader of the Opposition.

This government has shown further ignorance of what the people of Commonwealthland actually want: continued economic growth and a diversified economy that no longer is solely reliant on mining, energy, forestry, fishing and agricultural sectors. What the people of Commonwealthland want is an economy that has a strong services sector.

Now, who better to learn skills in the services sector to ensure the economy of Commonwealthland grows than our young people, who are so desperate for jobs and who are so keen to learn new skills and contribute to the economy? Where is the plan in this Act to ensure not only that the youth of Commonwealthland are able to learn skills that will help our economy grow, but a plan to ensure we don't solely rely on our traditional sectors, which have limited sustainability in the long run.

Once again, this government has abandoned the people — especially the youth of Commonwealthland — to follow their own idealistic motions that have no basis in fact. For a government that allegedly cares so much about their people, they don't seem to have spent that much time actually thinking about how to improve Commonwealthland.

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

This government just continues to throw money into the wind and hope it sticks somewhere that will be of some use. While the premise of this bill has good intentions, this bill in its current form cannot be passed.

My fellow members of the opposition have stated that this bill lacks sufficient detail to constitute an effective solution to the important issue of youth unemployment. This government needs to show some leadership, recognize the issue that exists with this mere draft of a bill, which is three pages, to ensure that this issue is tackled head-on.

May I add that it is three pages, not including the title page, the table of provisions and the summary — just in case that was unclear to those of the government who can't count.

This government needs to show some leadership, recognize the issues that exist with this draft of an act and ensure that this issue is tackled head-on in the most effective manner. I cannot commend this act in its current form to the House.

**Honeylynn Lisson:** Hon. Members, I stand here today in strong support for the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship bill. If passed, this bill will change lives, lower unemployment rates, strengthen businesses and improve the role young people play in our society and the way in which they are viewed.

However, despite these honourable intentions, and extremely likely positive outcomes, we have, somewhat unsurprisingly, become bogged down in theatrics, partisanship and petty insults.

To get back to the proposals themselves, I would like to bring the chamber's attention to a few key points and assuage the concerns raised by the opposition.

Firstly, an hon. member spoke of their worries that the young people who have not completed secondary education would be left behind by this bill. In response, I wish to bring attention to clause 2, which simply defines the youth eligible for this program as anyone aged 16 to 25. I'm not sure where this idea that secondary school must have been completed came from, but I assure you, it was not from the Progressive Party's bill. And I certainly hope that everyone in the chamber has read this only-three-pages-long bill thoroughly enough to know that.

Furthermore, clause 6 even explicitly outlines that preference can be made for those "whose education has been affected" or who experience any other of many important possible disadvantages. This, in itself, exemplifies the very ethos of this bill — to give opportunities to people who have not previously had enough of them — which will lead to an improved society.

Secondly, the government has constantly — and I mean

### CY P8

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT constantly — been accused of not truly having a plan or knowing how we are going to implement this legislation, something which is completely unjust and seems only to have been used to eat up debate time and fill this esteemed space with hyperbole and drama.

I again wish to bring us back down to earth, specifically Commonwealthland, and point to clauses 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11 — really, the whole bill — for evidence that we do have a plan.

For example, clause 7 — which, somewhat hypocritically, the Deputy Leader of the Opposition belittled — outlines the not-small task of creating a help line, a website and a social media campaign about this important legislation if it's passed. They did this as though communicating with constituents and promoting important programs is not an important task.

They have also disregarded that in clause 3 and clause 9, we clearly show that we are committed to setting defined goals.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): A point of order. Proceed, Member.

**Sky Losier:** The hon. member across the way referred to the Loyal Opposition as "they." As the government has eloquently pointed out numerous times, that is a breach of Standing Order 8.

Hon. Jordan Kerr: Madame Speaker, can I just clarify?

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Are you clarifying the point of order?

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** According to the point of order, point No. 8 specifically refers to referring to the debate in the second person, not in the third person.

[1540]

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Thank you, Member.

Member Lisson, continue.

**Honeylynn Lisson:** The opposition has also disregarded that in clause 3 and clause 9, we clearly show that we are committed to setting defined goals and reviewing how we're going and meeting these goals regularly, even when we know the often-undeserved hostility that we will face when we do so.

Either way, though, I would like to draw attention to clause 11, which explicitly states that the Governor-in-Council may make regulations for carrying out the purposes and provisions of this act, which upholds the very nature of lawmaking. Bills and acts are

meant to be somewhat broad to make it even vaguely possible to complete all of the important lawmaking work we are tasked with in our limited time. And clearly, even then, we are struggling.

The opposition said themselves: "We are not here to oppose but to ask how." So I ask — I beg, even — that now that we have explained and clarified how, we instead start focusing on the content of the bill and the effects of the bill. I plead that this entire chamber will stop arguing and start thinking of lives that will be changed, careers that will be enhanced, businesses that will grow and the important social runoff effects of really valuing youths — our most important asset, our future — that will occur. Please see reason, see progress, and vote for this bill.

**Danish Bhutto:** The hon. Member referred to only three pages, so it is alarming to see that only three pages could have innumerable lacunas and loopholes. I must come to the point that the purpose of the opposition is not just to criticize on the policies and the standard operating procedures designed by the government. I'm here to present some honest interventions and observations for improvement of the proposed act under consideration.

It is alarming to note that there's no mechanism, for our side. You are just throwing a lot of money, and you are not giving any oversight of the money that you are putting in. The first and foremost thing should be to chalk out an oversight mechanism. In this respect, I would suggest, first of all, to formulate an oversight committee, given the significance of the subject.

Secondly, there's no follow-up strategy. Like, you recruit people, and you put them through internships and apprenticeships. Once they are done, after one year, you completely leave them alone. What is your retention plan? Do you have any retention plan for the youth that you are putting in?

#### **Point of Order**

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** Just referring back to the standing orders, if the hon. parliamentarian can please refer to the government in the correct title, or by the surname of the member, as opposed to using the second person singular "you." Thank you.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Thank you, Member. All members please be guided accordingly.

**Danish Bhutto:** Point taken. Thank you, Madame Speaker.



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

#### **Debate Continued**

**Danish Bhutto:** I must say the government should also dedicate a section to monitoring and evaluation. Now you have the plan for internships, but you are not getting any monitoring and evaluation mechanism.

Interjection.

**Danish Bhutto:** But also for the employers.

Interjection.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Yes, government Member.

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** Madame Speaker, my apologies to keep interrupting, but if you can please guide the opposition in the correct debate manner, that would be much appreciated.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Member Bhutto, you may proceed.

Danish Bhutto: The government's focus should be on trade and acceleration of economic activity, to create more and more job opportunities. The financial and economic policy should be designed to attract finite investments. The idea of internships lacks sustainability. If we were to refer to the bill, the government should note that targets are not clearly defined. It's up to the responsibility of the minister to design the targets. Keeping the opposition deprived of the debate on the targets they are going to decide....

[1545]

Rather, the government should instead focus more on creating employers rather than employees. The government should instead introduce business loan schemes to foster the spirit of entrepreneurship and promote small and medium enterprise.

It's ironic that the government introduced the Ministry of Indigenous and Cultural Affairs. However, the government outright overlooks marginalized, discriminated and victimized communities when it comes to preference and placement.

**Hon. Jordan Kerr:** Madame Speaker, I refer to the standing orders of the House, No. 16. I just noted that the hon. Deputy Leader of the Opposition passed between you and the speaking member, which is in breach of Standing Order 16, when speaking to his learned colleague.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Duly noted, government Member, but kindly note that all members are fairly new parliamentarians, so I think some latitude would be warranted.

Member Bhutto, you may continue.

**Danish Bhutto:** As I say, it's ironic that the government introduced the Ministry of Indigenous and Cultural Affairs, but they outright ignored and overlooked marginalized, discriminated and victimized communities — including single parents, indigenous people and addicts, to name a few — in terms of preference and placements.

I must say, to conclude my point, that the bill, in current form, cannot be passed.

**Hon. Farah Hussain:** I would like to speak in favour of the bill before us today.

The opposition has mentioned that this bill is only three pages long, but we on this side believe that quality is better than quantity.

The bill we have before us is ambitious for Commonwealthland and ambitious for our young people. It recognizes that we can only progress through investment in our youth, who represent the future of our great nation.

Where I come from, the U.K., young people have been at the sharp end of the government's austerity program. Increased tuition fees, the spiralling cost of housing and insecurity in the job market, including the proliferation of unpaid internships, have been a recipe for disaster. This is the first time in postwar Britain that this generation will be worse off than their parents. That is what the party opposite wants for Commonwealthland. That is what they want for our young people.

The Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act that my colleague has presented puts forward practical solutions to real issues that the young people of Commonwealthland are facing. It places equal emphasis on vocational and more service-area skills and experience, which reflects the traditional industries in our society but also the emerging industries that are becoming more and more important for our economy.

The two schemes, the apprenticeship fund and the internship initiative, ensure that young people are given real, practical training in their chosen fields while being paid a decent wage. I can't emphasize how important that last point is — a decent wage. This would give them an advantage in the job market, allowing them to get good jobs, become active citizens and contribute to our society. This is an investment in our young people that will be paid



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT back many times over, during their working careers, in the form of income tax. It is good for our country, and it is good for our people.

Once again, I would like to thank my colleague for presenting this bill, and I look forward to voting in favour of it. I would like to thank the opposition, as well, for their suggestions, and I look forward to finally working with them constructively going forward.

**Gemma Finn:** One of the main concerns with this bill, from the opposition, is the complete lack of other employment benefits that are mentioned in it. There is simply no information and no regulation.

[1550]

Leaving aside the mention of generously paying interns and apprentices the minimum wage, there is no mention of sick leave. There is no mention of annual leave or pension contributions. There is also no determination that these young people will be protected regarding the possibility of working on-call hours or night shifts.

The government claims that they are helping our youth with this bill, but all we can see is something that has the potential to hinder them in the long run. The opposition would appreciate clarification on these matters.

**Rea Vanterpool:** The importance of the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act cannot be overstated. My colleagues have already identified several benefits that this bill would afford Commonwealthland. Even the opposition members have agreed to the goals and the spirit of the bill. I, too, would like to lend my voice in support of the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act.

In Commonwealthland, the service industry, such as retail trade, tourism, scientific and technical services and technology, is becoming increasingly important in our economy. The passage of this act will ensure that our young persons are involved in these industries as they continue to grow.

In speaking with my constituents, like my colleague I have found that many young persons wish to explore opportunities in these sectors but have been rejected by private sector businesses, who claim the inability to hire persons with now flimsy excuses, like the global recession of 2008 or the impending U.S. election. Those excuses cannot be accepted.

This morning the hon. member of the opposition suggested that private sector funding should be used instead of government funding of this program. However, it is this government's position that the implementation of this act, which will support liaising with rather than relying on the private sector, will ensure that

young persons are present at the growth stages of these sectors in Commonwealthland and can therefore lend their creative spirits to the development of innovative small businesses, products and, in turn, provide jobs for other young persons.

We cannot sit and wait for the private sector, and I would like to admonish my colleague that yelling about following the opposition is ineffective. We have seen what happens when we follow the opposition's reliance on the private sector acting benevolently. We end up with 6 percent unemployment in Commonwealthland. We end up with disenchanted young people who feel worthless.

This government insists on our young persons leading fulfilling lives. Therefore, we would never adopt a callous, useless, gutless approach, as the opposition so coldly suggested this morning. Help all, or help none. Help none? How can a member claim to be representing the people of Commonwealthland and choose to help no one because a bill doesn't appear to be perfect in his eyes?

I believe that once this bill is passed, the people of Commonwealthland will be thankful that they elected the Progressive Party. This government saw a need and is moving quickly to fill it. We do not need a novel to say what our plans will be. Our bill gets straight to the point. We stand for investing in our young people. We stand for putting our young people in positions to be active contributors to developing sectors, to be entrepreneurs, to be change-makers.

We stand for progress, and we will make our young people the agents of taking our nation to a position of influence in the global economy.

Jenae Whittaker: I'd like to apply a correction on the government. They are quoted as saying — and something I discussed earlier — that the private sector should be included with this budget. Not as a whole, but together. Government cannot take the burden of all the financial aspects to control acts that are proposed in this bill. I believe that I was misquoted as saying that the private sector should have most of it. It should be both the government and the private sector that should participate in the financial aspect of this bill and what's being proposed.

[1555]

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Thank you for that point of clarification.

**Rea Vanterpool:** I did point out in my contribution that we would be liaising with the private sector. My point is that we



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT cannot sit and wait for the private sector to realize that our young people are important. We must take the lead.

**Rebecca Cross:** Hon. Members, we are concerned at the amount of discretionary power the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Bill gives to the Minister of Social Development. The minister is to set targets, but on what basis? What will the government be measuring? What jobs will these internships lead to? What wage will be specified?

If the ministry is so committed to tackling youth unemployment, it needs to provide more detail in the bill as to how the ministry will exercise its powers. The opposition can only support the movement to committee stage on the basis of clearer detail. We have a youth unemployment problem, not a youth internship problem. I ask the government: will this proposed legislation tackle the problem? No. It's an ineffective solution.

**Gabriel Laurence-Brook:** I would like to continue my constructive critique of my own party's doings by getting a little bit philosophical for one minute. Indeed, my question is: why is it so important to us to give people jobs? It is, quite frankly, baffling to me — the importance that we give, in modernity, to giving people jobs.

The German philosopher Hannah Arendt pointed out that, throughout history, working and having a job was really something that you wanted to get out of — that you actually didn't want to do. The aristocrats were the people who didn't have to work. We had only contempt for people who were working. She made the useful distinction between three activities in the *vita activa*, the active life. She said there are three different categories: labour, work and action. Action is basically participating in the democratic life and political life.

The distinction that is useful here is the distinction between labour and work. Labour is what you do because you need to fulfil your basic needs. Labour is imposed on you by the necessity of life. Labour is really not something you choose to do, but something you are forced to do just because you need to eat, drink and have a roof. Whereas work is more like something that is fulfilling, something that gives a sense of meaning to your existence.

I think that distinction is really useful just to show that not all jobs create well-being or give a sense of meaning to people's existence, because there are jobs that pertain to the domain of labour, whereas there are jobs that are really fulfilling. Jobs for jobs, just like growth for growth, to me seems like nonsense.

Let's return to the question I asked before: why do we want

to give people jobs? Well, the obvious answer today would be: because they need money to buy the stuff necessary to sustain their existence. But my question is: is there another way to do that? What if we shared the value created by our economy among all our citizens through an unconditional basic income that would be substantial enough so that everybody could fulfil their basic needs without having to work?

[1600]

This proposition is actually truly progressive, because it would be imposed so that we share the fruits of capital, we share the accumulated labour of the past generations that is capital. We share it equally. We really share what our economy is doing with all our citizens without having them work, necessarily. People who want to engage in work because their work, their job, gives them a sense of meaning, a sense of really being useful to society, can continue to work. But people who are forced to work because of the necessity of life, who are working in poor conditions, can actually get out of work and live a more meaningful existence without having to work.

In addition, we are faced with a problem of automation of the economy. That means that jobs are getting replaced by machines and robots. This is really an issue that is very, very concerning to me. That means that in the future decades, we can already see that we have less jobs for people who come out of technical and non-educated backgrounds because, basically, just basic jobs can be fulfilled by robots. In the near future, I think it's really important that we reflect and that we think about another solution to give people the means necessary to live their lives without having to work.

This bill is not bad — quite the opposite — but I fear that we are just tackling a surface issue while the roots of the problem remain untouched.

**Hon. Laura Elliott:** I would like to address youth apprenticeships as an access to work, as an alternative to full-time education. In lending my support for the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act, I urge the opposition to look at the employment landscape with renewed expectations.

The road to college and university has been paved with a single view for too long. There is a constant balance that goes on between the definition of a good job and the understanding of a truly valuable education. Not all knowledge comes from a school, and not all skills are learnt through a degree.

What we have learnt through consultation with employers in Commonwealthland is that employers want people who have



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT actual skills and who can demonstrate that they can actually do something. More than that, these employers are willing to work with us to achieve this through our apprenticeship and internship scheme.

Through a youth employment information service, this bill is offering a one-stop shop to link employers and youths seeking employment. Through dedicated staff, help lines and Internet sites, we would be able to be the missing link between unemployment and underactive employment sectors.

There is great value in apprenticeships. Many dwindling employment sectors are not involved in succession planning, so without plugging the gap in the market, these traditional disciplines may disappear forever.

Of course, the bill has restrictions and requirements placed on those who enter the scheme. If our young people show a willingness to seek employment or training, then they will be rewarded.

I would also like to mention the soft skills that are able to be enjoyed outside of formal education. The role of youth groups across our societies provides invaluable training and benefit to young people outside of an educational setting. Informal learning has been of greatest benefit to me. It is what has brought me here today, and it all took place through the medium of a youth movement with rural issues at its heart — something this bill would support, under point 6.

Everybody is a genius in their own way, but if you judge a fish by its ability to climb a tree, then it will live its life believing it is stupid. We are all serving an apprenticeship of some kind. I would urge the opposition to duly consider this apprenticeship and internship bill. After all, are they not serving an apprenticeship of their own? One day they may learn their trade and become government.

**Dwaynifia Joseph:** Let me first commend the government for the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act. There are areas, however, that need to be improved to further develop this bill.

[1605]

In my homeland, Montserrat, we've recently launched a youth task force, of which I am a part. We have many deliverables that we're aiming to complete over a course of two years. One such deliverable is the PSEA program, the private sector employment assistance program. As its name indicates, this program is geared to pairing unemployed youth on Montserrat with local entrepreneurs to acquire a skill base over a year's period. After the year is up, the entrepreneur can choose to keep this apprentice, or the apprentice may choose to start his or her own business.

The task force is currently acquiring data from the island's youth about their interests and any skills they wish to gain or harness. We're hoping to conduct interviews among entrepreneurs and the youth by the end of this month so that they may be assigned to these businesses by December.

The government has not exactly outlined in the bill the process, whether it will be by contract, the programs that will be offered or the benefits that these young people will derive in the long run. Can the government tell this honourable House what will happen to our young people after the six months have elapsed? There are gaps to be filled in this bill. The opposition is available at any time to provide assistance to clarify and to make necessary amendments to this bill so that our young people are well taken care of.

Jamie Murray: Good afternoon. May I thank you, also, for this opportunity to speak at the eighth sitting of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament once again. I am pleased to rise in support of this bill.

As you may have gathered, Madame Speaker, and as colleagues across the prestigious benches may have gathered also, the Progressive Party has fully committed to benefiting the lives of young people that we represent. We've been elected on a mandate of change. That change, specifically, was reducing the percentage of youth who are currently unemployed. This is an issue not least across Commonwealthland, and we have a solution to this pressing issue.

This bill, proposed by this government, ultimately addresses a market failure. Businesses are simply not currently providing these opportunities to young people. These apprenticeships and internships do not exist. Make no mistake about it: this will have a detrimental impact on the young people of Commonwealthland. This government's bill absolutely stimulates job creation and amplifies opportunity.

The opposition's plan. Well, if only we knew what it was, then we could comment on it.

It's also imperative to discuss the fact that we do have preexisting legislation on employment. We have a set minimum wage, and we are building on such policies to improve young people's lives. No piece of legislation works in isolation. This bill will complement our existing workplace legislation. This includes employment benefits and health and safety protections.

This government is committed to improving the prospects of young people, I repeat. To repeat the words of the Finance Minister, proportional taxing is a method that we can employ moving forward to bring this bill into practice.



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT It's also important to mention here that we aim to partner with our businesses to create a working relationship with them, where we combine our means to ensure all the young people are considered, assisted and listened to. After all, as a government, we listen to those who speak, rather than criticizing those who act. We have a plan, and we will use our proposed methods. It's not members here who will benefit; it's the young people that we represent.

Anne Ogada: Hon. Members, I rise to support the spirit of this particular act. However, as the hon. member who has just spoken says, there are various aspects they have put in consideration, such as health and safety. I really wonder: was any public participation carried out during the drafting of this bill? I ask this because when you're doing public participation, you go to the people whom the act affects, whom the act is intended for.

In this case, I feel like this bill has the spirit that the government is doing a favour to the youth of Commonwealthland. What I mean by "doing them a favour" is that they are not giving the youth an opportunity to seek legal redress in case of exploitation, in case of misuse by employers.

[1610]

Let us face it. We have all been in programs — internships or otherwise. For those of you who are blessed to be working, you have all gone through this: the first job, the first internship. We all have these untold stories.

We have stories of exploitation, whereby your employer or where you're doing your apprenticeship.... They use you for reasons that are not under the contract. Instead of giving you official work, they send you on errands. For the females, probably, there are cases of sexual exploitation.

These are the realities on the ground. Where is the opportunity for these beneficiaries of the program to seek legal redress? We have to face the reality. These are the challenges on the ground.

#### Nicholas Hawkes: Gura mie ayd, Madame Speaker.

Hon. Members, ever increasingly, we expect young people to attain a university education. While I do not deny that our society should strive to be better informed, the notion that university is the only option for those seeking to gain meaningful employment sets a dangerous precedent.

I have been lucky. The Manx government has graciously paid for my education and given me the opportunity to pursue my interests at a tertiary level. I am very well aware that not everyone sitting in this chamber has been awarded the same opportunity. I do not take that gift for granted.

While I believe that university was the correct option for me, others find themselves at a loss, forced down a rabbit hole by a society which increasingly sees non-compulsory tertiary education as a right of passage into the world of work. We should encourage our young people to pursue other options, different paths, ones which do not rely on the submission of a dissertation.

This is, in essence, what the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act seeks to achieve: to expand options available to our young people and to provide support mechanisms for a number of businesses at all levels to take on younger workers. And not only to provide them with experience, which will stand them in good stead in the future employment market, but also pay them a wage which they can survive on. The hourly rate for an apprentice in the U.K. under the age of 19 is £3.40. That's \$5.50 Canadian for an adult in a trade. We cannot simply accept that a blind passion alone will lead someone to undertake an apprenticeship or unpaid internship.

I agree with the opposition. We need to broaden the base, but that cannot be achieved by simply allowing the status quo to continue. Internships overwhelmingly benefit those who can afford to take unpaid employment in the first place. The idea that where there is a will, there will be a way does not always prevail when you're balancing an unpaid internship, paid work and studying. This bill sets out a way for the will to thrive.

Now, you may call me naive, but I believe that investing in those who have the most to offer isn't just a safe bet. It's a smart economic plan. That is why I support this bill, and I encourage all other members to do so and work with us on delivering a program of statutory documents to support it.

**Jared McGill:** All I'm hearing from the government is: "We have a plan. We have a plan." You know, I believe that the guy that invented the lightbulb had a plan. He failed over a thousand times, and the lightbulb worked. So my question is: how many times is the government going to fail before the lightbulb starts to work?

It is my opinion that the young people of Commonwealthland have given up hope in this government due to the increasing unemployment rate that has been shown. It is good that the government is paying attention to the people's unemployment rate, but I noted that most of the people on the government are not economists. I don't know if they've even taken an economics class. What I know from economics is that you inject a lot of money into the economy when the economy is in a recession. So my question to you: is the economy in a recession?



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH YOUTH PARLIAMENT Interjections.

**Jared McGill:** All right. I'll rephrase. Is the government's economy in a recession?

[1615]

The government has failed to deliver on their plans. Who is to say that the government will carry out this plan? The unemployment is increasing, the birth rate is increasing, and the GDP per capita cannot sustain the idealistic views that the government has.

Now, we in the opposition don't disagree with the bill. It's just that if there were some amendments to the bill.... Like everything in life, there is always a need for improvement.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): Hon. youth parliamentarian, noting the time, I ask that you take your seat.

Minister closes the debate.

**Hon. Kareina Mohammed:** It is indeed the government's plan, which we have proposed in this hon. House. It is the opposition that keeps sounding like a broken record, saying: "You have a plan." Of course, we have a plan. We proposed it to you.

Now, the length of the act, as was discussed, does not determine the content and power of this act. The bill does not deal specifically with entrepreneurship. Yes, that's true. However, through the bill and the opportunities that will be provided through the development of entrepreneurial skills, with regards to the apprenticeship and internship, you are being guided and you are being taught by those by whom you are employed.

Now, we keep hearing, "throwing money at this and hoping it will stick to the walls," and all of this drama. I am very confident in our Minister of Economy and Business, who is very capable. He is meticulous and transparent in managing the finances of this, our Commonwealthland.

I understand that we have some qualms about what will happen between the employer and the apprentice or the intern. There will be a contract between the employer, the government and the apprentice or the intern to protect our youth and to encourage transparency and accountability. We have laboured on this debate, and we can agree that our youth unemployment situation is a problem. We can all agree.

I want to emphatically state that the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act is a real solution to a real problem. Liaising with both the private and public sectors — as I support my hon. member

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

over there — the government would encourage the businesses in the private sector and also the ministries to ensure that employment opportunities be provided for the youth apprentices and interns of Commonwealthland.

We agree that unemployment can have negative effects on individuals by causing feelings of depression, of sadness—as noted by a member of the opposition—even suicidal thoughts. Further, this negatively impacts our society of the Commonwealthland by putting a damper on our economy and our standard of living. The bill seeks to increase the opportunities for youth employment, thereby remedying this problem.

We can only go forward from here. We can only progress from here. The Progressive Party understands this. We believe this, and we will invest in our youth. In Commonwealthland, our youth are our greatest asset. We will do all within our power to hone their skills, for our future lies in their hands — the hands that we will take into our care and train, the minds that will mould and the character that will build through this, the Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act.

[1620]

Of course, everything can take improvement. It is true. We look forward to actually doing this.

With that, I move second reading.

Second reading of Bill 1 approved on the following division:

**YEAS** — 32

NAYS — 18

**Hon. Kareina Mohammed:** I move that the bill be referred to a Committee of the Whole House to be considered at the next sitting of the House after today.

Bill 1, Youth Apprenticeship and Internship Act, read a second time and referred to a Committee of the Whole House for consideration at the next sitting of the House after today.

Hon. Jordan Kerr moved adjournment of the House.

Motion approved.

Hon. Ingrid Moses-Scatliffe (Speaker of the Commonwealth Youth Parliament): The House now stands adjourned until 1:15 tomorrow.

The House adjourned at 4:23 p.m.



EIGHTH COMMONWEALTH
YOUTH PARLIAMENT

Tuesday, November 8, 2016

#### HANSARD REPORTING SERVICES

#### Director Robert Sutherland

Manager of Reporting Services Christine Fedoruk

> Publishing Supervisor Laurel Bernard

Editorial Team Leaders Janet Brazier, Karol Morris, Robyn Swanson, Glenn Wigmore

> Technical Operations Officers Pamela Holmes, Dan Kerr, Michael Sinclair

Indexers Shannon Ash, Julie McClung, Robin Rohrmoser

Researchers Mike Beninger, Mary Beth Hall, David Mattison, Steve Pocock

#### Editors

Kim Christie, Deirdre Gotto, Jane Grainger, Betsy Gray, Iris Gray, Barb Horricks, Bill Hrick, Jessica Hutchings, Jennifer Kaddoura, Catherine Lang, Paula Lee, Donna McCloskey, Bob McIntosh, Anne Maclean, Claire Matthews, Jill Milkert, Lind Miller, Erik Pedersen, Janet Pink, Amy Reiswig, Murray Sinclair, Antoinette Warren, Arlene Wells, Kim Westad

Published by British Columbia Hansard Services, and printed under the authority of the Speaker.

www.leg.bc.ca/cyp8

Access to on-line versions of the report of proceedings (*Hansard*) and webcasts of proceedings is available on the Internet.